

**SOCIAL AUDIT AND PUBLIC HEARING**  
**AT**  
**UPAR BALRAM, JAMMA BLOCK IN DUMKA**  
**JHARKHAND**  
**2007**

DATE: 30/05/07

SUBJECT: - NATIONAL RURAL EMPLOYMENT GUARANTY ACT- 2005 (NREGA)  
VENUE: - PRIMARY SCHOOL, UPAR BALRAM,  
PANCHAYAT: - NACHANGARIA, BLOCK: - JAMA BLOCK  
DISTRICT: DUMKA

Social audit has been started in Santhal Pargana Region of Jharkhand with the introduction of Citizen Action Initiatives in the year 2005. Till last year i.e. 2006 there had been six numbers Social Audit Cum Public Hearing in the region that being carried out by Citizens Initiatives Network. During this current year-2007 there had been four numbers of Social Audit Cum Public hearings. They have been conducted at TELO, Boarijore block of Godda district. Two have been conducted in Pakur district i.e. at Litipara block at Dharampur and Mahespur block. Similarly one in Dumka district at Upar Balram village of Nachargaria Panchayat in Jama block. During this year it was proposed to conduct 5 Social Audit Cum Public Hearing in Santhal Pargana region. List is as follows.

SN	NAME OF FEDARATION	NAME OF PARTICIPANTS	PLACE	DISTRICT	ISSUES
01	Ato Baisi	Mr. Bibhas Chandra	Telo	Godda	Arnapurna, Anttadaya NOAP
02	Yuva Sangha	Mr Jagendra	Punsia	Godda	TSC
03	Manjhi Pargana Sadan	Mr. Kalidas Malto	Dharampur	Pakur	ICDS
04	Aven Manjhi Baisi	Mr Sanjiv Kumar	Domnabandh	Pakur	TSC
05	Gram Sabha Sangha	Mr. Kaleswar Mondal	Nachangaria	Dumka	NREGA

Prior to this Social Audit cum Public hearing was carried out in mentioned area cadres were selected by the partner organization/ CBOs. After selection of cadres, training to cadres was imparted the SATHEE office for selected and lead cadres. These trained cadres then imparted training to other cadres at the respective partner organization

office / selected venue. These trained cadres collected information in their respective villages where the community in gram Sabha selected them. After collections of data were completed in the villages; cadres were imparted training on Social Audit and Public hearing, data analysis.

Social Audit Cum Public hearing was organized at Upar Balram village of Nachangaria Panchayat of Jama block in Dumka District. Gram Sabha Sangha, Nachangaria by Mr. Kaleswar Mondal'.

The following Process was followed by the organization to carry out the Social Audit cum Public hearing Prior at Upar Balram, Nachangaria.

- Cadres collected primary data from the villages through prescribed format prepared by SATHEE and network of Citizen Action.
- Then the villagers in respective Gram Sabha analyzed collected data.
- Then villagers did self-social audit in the Gram Sabha on different govt. programmes those being implemented by govt.
- Then villagers did joint meeting of Gram Sabha in a common place where they discussed regarding their problems those were found in their area.
- Then they decided to conduct Social Audit cum Public hearing in their Panchayat.
- Also they selected venue where the social audit and Public hearing would be conducted.
- In the joint meeting of Gram Sabha, villagers selected members of Jury Committee.
- In the committee demarked the area for social audit and public hearing.

After the above process was over to make the audit process success and fruitful following steps were taken.

- Audit team members were given orientation of social audit and public hearing. Once again importance of social audit and public hearing was discussed with the team. The lead cadre of the area led all the process.
- Orientation of audit team on the issues and objectives of the social audit.
- Once again the team members visited the villages to know the present status of the area.
- Again there was discussion among the audit team members regarding demarcation of audit area, geographical coverage of public hearing and audit periods (time period/financial year).
- Setting up of important parameters for the public hearing with the team members.
- Prepared formats and documents those are needed for procurement of information from the villages/ fields.
- Audit team was orientated on issues and objectives of social Audit and public hearing.
- Also the audit team has been orientated on proper filling up of format and schedules while collecting data from the field.

- Oriented audit team for proper application of prepared formats /schedules to take out the field data.
- Also team was oriented how to collected informations form the govt. department through the Citizens' initiatives (Community or Community representatives).
- Identified parameters on which govt. data to be collected for the social audit.
- Legal basis ensured in procuring relevant data and informations from the Govt. departments as laid down in the guidelines, local acts, state acts, central acts, etc. For this Public hearing, informations were collected through RTI Act – 2005. the following informations had been asked by the gram sabha for this Social audit and Public hearing at Upar balram village.

SN	Govt. Departments/ Officials	Data / Information	Date of appli- cation	Received
1	Block Office / BDO, Jama, Dumka	Information related to NREGA like village wise no. of Family Registered.	April -07	Received
2	Block Office / BDO, Jama, Dumka	Ongoing Work / schemes	April -07	Received
3	Block Office / BDO, Jama, Dumka	Name of Agency implementing the work	April -07	Received
4	Block Office / BDO, Jama, Dumka	Estimate Cost	April -07	Received
5	Block Office / BDO, Jama, Dumka	Muster Role	April - 07	Received
6	Block Office / BDO, Jama, Dumka	Bills	April -07	Received

NB : All the above informations were collected through RTI Act -20005

- After data and informations were collected from the Government departments, then comparative analysis of these collected data and informations were carried out by the audit team along with local leaders of CBOs. Here in this meeting sharing of findings was also held among the present participants. Also they finalized the venue and date for the social audit cum public hearing. It was finalized that the Social audit cum public hearing would be held in Upar Balram of Chikania Panchayat of Jama block. Here are findings, which were chalked out while analyzing the primary data with the secondary data and informations.

#### ✓ NREGA REGISTRATION

- Registration of family for NREGA was not done in a special meeting of Gram Sabha in the respective villages.
- Registration of family is not being carried out regularly.

- Still to day there are many families who are interested to register them selves in the NREGA programme for availing the schemes.

✓ TRANSPARANCCY IN ISSUE OF JOB CARD

- Job cards were not issued within 15 days from the days from the date of registration for this NREGS.
- No information regarding the issue of job card was placed in Panchayat office.
- In Panchayat office there is no record or photocopy of document related to issue of job cards.
- All the beneficiaries got the job card free of cost.
- Still today there are many family who have registered themselves, but yet to get the job card.

- ✓ Whether the work or schemes are selected on basis of application for work received from the job cardholders?

- Community does not know that they need to apply for the work (NREGA).

✓ TRANSPARENCY IN IMPLEMENTAION OF PROGRAMME.

- Implementation of work has not been carried out as per the guideline of the scheme. It has been violated while implementing the programme.
- Notice on the detail information of work has been made in the working site.
- Muster roles are not kept all the time in the work site.
- Monitoring committee does not monitor the progress of the work at regular interval.
- Within seven days of completion of work there has not been any open discussion among the villagers who had worked in the activity and other community members of the same village for evaluation of the work.

✓ TRANSPARENCY IN SELECTION OF WORK

- There has not been any discussion in concerned gram sabha regarding the proposed work.
- Community or respective Gram Sabha's consent was not taken while preparing the development plan for the villages.
- Even selection of work has not been carried out from the list of work that has been listed in the Act.
- In last 6 months there has not been any monitoring presentation of work expenditure incurred in the Panchayat on sanctioned work of a particular area.
- Notices relating to work done in the worksite have not been updated.

## ✓ WAGE PAYMENT

- Wage not paid within seven days of work.
  - While wage payment is made detail of wage to be paid and wage paid is not read out.
  - No individual is being cheated during wage payment.
  - Till date there has not been any due in wage payment.
  - No body is paid below the minimum wage rate..
- All the above findings were shared in Gram Sabha while analyzing the data.
- Mass mobilization was organized through organizing joint meetings of Gram Sabha.
- Organized joint meetings of audit team and key leaders of Gram Sabha.
- Then meeting of audit team members, Gram sabha leaders and local CBOs was held at Uparbalram village. In the meeting dates and venue for the social audit cum public hearing was finalized.
- Initialized wall writing, displayed poster and distributed hand bills announced the date for the Social audit and Public hearing in common places through traditional and modern audio system.
- Identification of testimonies from the area.
- While selecting Testimonies following criteria were taken into consideration.
- Direct victims of the situation prevailing.
  - Indirectly affecting.
  - Village leaders/traditional community leader-the decision maker on the community problem at various levels.
  - Local active cadre/volunteers has been actively involving in the community level problems/relevant issues.
  - Active women individual will be selected on a priority basis.
  - Vocal and daring individual will be given priority.

### List of Testimony

SN	NAME	VILLAGE
01	Munishi Tudu	Ahlah Dumaris
02	Kina Ram Tudu	Do
03	Babulal Marandi	Heth Balram
04	Lilu Marandi	Do
05	Parbati Baski	Do
06	Nira Devi	Kolharia
07	Mulind Soren	Upar Balram
08	Budhan Ray	Do
09	Manju Devi	Chiharbani
10	Kaloni Baski	Do

- Then orientation of testimonies was held.
- Finally decision was taken for conducting public hearing at Uparbalram.

## PROCESS ON PUBLIC HEARING DAY

Before the start of Public hearing, community who were present on that day selected the Jury. The following persons were selected as Jury.

- Radhe Shyam
- Annu Ray
- Bhim Mondal
- Mohan Singh
- Shubhan Bhand
- Mahavir Ray
- Chhabinath Mandal
- Nunulal Murmu
- Dhape Tudu

## INTRODUCTION ABOUT PUBLIC HEARING

- It is an open forum where all the parties i.e. representatives from govt. departments, Elected People's representatives, Gram Sabha leaders, local CBOs representatives, selected cadres (who have form a social audit team) would placing their own view regarding the progress of programme implementation. After placing their view it would be analyzed in the present mass regarding exact progress.
- In the open forum it would asked the service providers regarding non completion of work/ programme, deviation in the activity, improper functioning of the the govt. departments and also people would be asked to give clarification for non cooperation in implementation of work.
- Then in this forum it self the responsible person to be asked to give clarification what coarse of action to be taken to make the programme complete/ non-deviation in the programme.
- It is short of evaluation of programme implementation or work implementation.

## NEED FOR SOCIAL AUDIT

- Social audit is important for monitoring the progress of the programme / work/ activity which is going on in the village or panchayat.
- It can check the proper utilization of public money for the cause of citizen.
- It brings transparency in the programme, fund utilization and progress.

## PROCESS OF SOCIAL AUDIT AND PUBLIC HEARING

- CBO selected the cadres from the concerned villages and they were given orientation in two phases one at central level i.e. at SATHEE where lead cadres were given orientation and another at the CBOs / NGOs level where the lead cadres gave training by the lead cadres and were supported by Coordinator of Citizens Action. In both cases the cadres were given training and orientation on

different govt. programmes being carried out in their area. Also they were given orientation on data collection, social audit and public hearing. The objective of Social audit and public hearing was also narrated to them.

- After this cadres training, they collected base line information on all govt. programmes those are being implemented or supposed to be implemented.
- It was again discussed in larger forum where people from 14-gram sabha participated in the discussion. Here data of all the gram sabhas were shared and findings were chalked out, analyzed the situation of the programmes those are being implemented or supposed to be implemented.
- After analysis the gram sabha came to conclusion that they would go for social audit and public hearing in the area.
- Then they formed a team who would be taking charge of social audit. The audit team comprises of selected cadres, Gram Sabha leaders and representatives from CBOs'.
- In this larger mass gathering villagers also decided to collect information form the concerned department. If the informations were not available smoothly then they would be getting information through RTI Act- 2005. Finally the villagers got all the information through RTI Act –2005.
- In between this process Audit team was orientated regarding object of Social Audit and public hearing.
- After the collection of data from the field audit team analysed the data and fond out the problem those exist in their area.
- Then team fixed a date for social audit and invited govt. officials, local political leaders.
- Then team chalked out the finds in the chart papers for presentation on Social audit and Public hearing day.
- On the day social audit, team selected members for jury team
- Welcome the guests/ representatives form govt. departments.
- Then objective of Social audit and public hearing was described to the mass.
- Then findings and testimonies were read out.

Then the individuals on the desk presented each of the testimony. The detail is given below-

Sl. No.	Name of Testimony	Village	What she/He explained
1	Sri Munisi Tudu	Ahlah Dumaris	Explained about the non payment of wages and less wage payment up to 40 RS
2	Sri Kinaram Tudu	Ahlah Dumaris	Same
3	Sri Babulal Marandi	Hetha Balaram	No issuing job cards and taken 50 Rs per job cards
4	Smt. Lilu Marandi	Hetha Balram	Same
5	Smt. Parbati Baski	Hetha Balram	Plan not in accordance of the villagers. Low wage payment and irregular payment.
6	Smt. Nira Devi	Kolharia	Delayed issuing job cards and taken 50 Rs per job cards
7	Smt. Mulind Soren	Uparbalaram	Signatures in Muster rolls at three times and also false entry in the cards.
8	Sri Budhan Ray	Uparbalaram	Low wage payment, not given job cards and non of the facilities on site.
9	Smt. Manju Devi	Chiharbani	Same and extremely poor payment 30-35 Rs
10	Smt. Kaloni Baski	Chiharbani	Since last one month hankering for the registration but not done. Wants bribe.

#### REACTION FROM THE GUEST / GOVT. OFFICIALS

- After listening the findings and testimonies there was immediate reaction from the guest officials/ people who have been working in the govt. offices/ working under the contractor.
- Here in Upar Balram representatives of different contractors were de-motivating the villagers who had been patiently listening and participating in the public hearing.
- These vested interest group also tried to disturb the public hearing by involving young youths of their age (youths' age were between 15-22 years)



- Assured to correct the things with in fortnight otherwise workers will be punished

## JURY'S DECISION

At the end of the Public hearing Jury took the following decisions.

- Awareness on NREGA needs to be increased and improved by the Panchayat Secretary.
- With in 15 -20 days all card holders to be provided with work.
- All the applicants and interested families to be provided with jobs cards with in next 15 days.
- For proper and successful implementation of NREGA, panchayat coordinator to be appointed in the next 15 days.
- Rate of wage to be determined in accordance with the nature of soil.
- Where here ever there is panchayat building, all information to be written in the notice.
- All the registration in the panchayat to be carried out in the presence of Gram Sabha president.
- All the schemes those are being implemented under NREGA to be reflected in information notice and copy of muster role to be kept in every gram sabha.
  
- In NREGA programme all the inter mediatory to be swept out from the sceen.
- Immediately, with in 10 days start conducting Panchayat day ( Panchayat divas) and Employment day ( Rojgar Divas) in the panchayat.

## IMMEDIATE IMPACT OF SOCIAL AUDIT AND PUBLIC HEARING

When citizens' initiative started preparing to conduct social audit cum public hearing in Nachangaria panchayat the following immediate reactions started coming in.

- One of the contractor started giving cash to the people who have worked and not been paid for their work.
- Cleaver contractors engaged local youths to make this Social audit and public hearing failure.
- Some contractors used local youth to de-motivate the people by giving beautiful hope like had this been a contractor meeting then you could have got plenty & lucrative food along with enough drinks ( alcoholic). But here you would not be getting.
- If you go for contractor's rally then you would have got wage of that day, but here you would not be getting rather you loosed one day's wage by attending this useless meeting without any facility.
-

# CA ALL DISTIC SOCIAL MONITARING COMPILE REPORT

C A PROJECT ( 2009-10 APRILto MARCH )

## QUATERLY REPORT

ACTIVITY		GODDA	SAHEBGANG	PAKUR	DUMKA	BOKARO	DHANBAD	JAMTARA	TOTAL
<b>8 F.NAREGA PROGRAM</b>									
A	* TOTAL FAMILY	9590	1135	1017	4550	409	3485	574	20760
B	* INTERESTED FAMILY	6606	795	952	3965	375	2761	325	15779
C	* JOB CARD RECIVED FAMILY	6135	384	801	2669	255	313	245	10802
D	* EMPLYMENT RECIVED FAMILY	1090	167	570	803	137	212	122	3101
E	* CREATED MAN DAYS	11673	1123	1167	4690	2192	2960	1760	25565
F	* NO. OF FEMALE LABOUR	234	32	113	110	23	31	8	551
G	* NO. OF ACTUAL LABOUR CHARGE REC	1001	167	482	798	137	181	122	2888
H	* DUES LABOUR CHARGE	89	0	88	5	0	31	0	213
<b>9 G. PLAND WORK BY GRAM SABHA</b>									
A	* TANK	32	45	12	7	0	42	23	161
B	* WELL	16	45	3	30	0	0	27	121
C	* AAHAR	4	15	28	3	0	0	0	50
D	* LAND LEVELING	10	0	28	6	0	0	25	69
E	* PLANTING	4	0	2	0	0	0	6	12
F	* ROAD CONSTRUCTION	12	0	7	16	0	5	22	62
G	* OTHER WATER RESOURCE	0	0	1	1	0	8	0	10

**CA ALL DISTIC SOCIAL MONITARING COMPILE REPORT**

**C A PROJECT (2010-11APRIL TO OCT )**

**QUATERLY REPORT**

ACTIVITY		GODDA	PAKUR	BOKAR O	DHANB AD	JAMTAR A	TOTAL
<b>1</b>	<b>F.NAREGA PROGRAM</b>						
A	* TOTAL FAMILY	638	442	342	792	710	2924
B	* INTERESTED FAMILY	623	433	364	407	670	2497
C	* JOB CARD RECIVED FAMILY	523	375	273	292	374	1837
D	* EMPLYMENT RECIVED FAMILY	188	24	25	52	59	348
E	* CREATED MAN DAYS	1009	192	162	735	240	2338
F	* NO. OF FEMALE LABOUR	54	13	2	20	17	106
G	* NO. OF ACTUAL LABOUR CHARGE RECIVED	188	19	25	52	59	343
H	* DUES LABOUR CHARGE	0	5	0	0	0	5
<b>2</b>	<b>G. PLAND WORK BY GRAM SABHA</b>						
A	* TANK	8	3	9	1	4	25
B	* WELL	5	5	2	0	3	15
C	* AAHAR	2	2	1	0	1	6
D	* LAND LEVELING	10	7	2	2	4	25
E	* PLANTING	6	2	0	0	1	9
F	* ROAD CONSTRUCTION	2	1	2	3	2	10
G	* OTHER WATER RESOURCE	0	0	0	0	0	0